

Evolving the status quo or time to reset?

griffithsandarmour.com

Contents

Forewords			
1. List of contributors	05		
2. Executive Summary			
3. Introduction and background: what's past is prologue			
4. Dynamics of disruption	15		
Legal dynamics	16		
i. Bespoke onerous contracts	16		
ii. Joint and several liability	20		
iii. Indemnity spend on claims	22		
Construction dynamics	27		
i. Quality in the construction industry	27		
ii. Post-pandemic hybrid working	32		
iii. Barriers to modern methods of construction	36		
iv. The climate change emergency	39		
Insurance dynamics	42		
i. PI limits – the international context	42		
ii. Is PI insurance part of the problem?	45		
5. Conclusions			
Contact			
Citations			



In putting together this publication, we have been ably assisted by the following individuals to whom we extend our sincere thanks:

Fergus	Adams	Managing Director	Dougall Baillie Associates Limited
Peter	Anderson	Managing Partner	Troup Bywaters & Anders
Julian	Baker	Managing Director	Ellis Williams
Hendrie	Barber	Managing Director	MHB Consultants
James	Barrett	Financial Director	OCSC Consulting Engineers
Paul	Berg	Managing Director - Professional Risks	Griffiths & Armour
Harbinder	Birdi	Partner	Birdi & Partners
Alastair	Blundell	Head of General Insurance	British Insurance Brokers' Association
Neil	Brown	Partner	Fairhurst
Anne Marie	Conibear	Director & Company Secretary	JB Barry & Partners
Michael	Coombs	Managing Director	Alan Baxter
lan	Craig	Founding Director	Evolve Consulting Engineers
Gary	Davidson	Group Legal Director and Company Secretary	AKT II
Hannah	Dougan - Gaftea	Legal and Risk Director	RSBG Limited
Carl	Evans	Group Chief Executive - Professional Risks	Griffiths & Armour
Paul	Falconer	Chairman	Falconer Chester Hall
Sue	Foster	Executive Assistant	Griffiths & Armour
			Waterman Group PLC
Stephanie	George	Head of Legal	•
Kevin	Gray	Director	Carter Gregson Gray
Steven	Hales	Director	Crofton Consulting
Brian	Hamilton	Director	G3 Consulting Engineers
Jennifer	Hamilton	Net Zero Lead	RPS Group
Stephen	Hargreaves	Professional Risks Director	Griffiths & Armour
Fergus	Harradence	Deputy Director, Infrastructure, Construction & Rail	Department of Business & Trade
Patrick	Hayes	Technical Director	Institution of Structural Engineers
Gavin	Henderson	Partner	Kennedys Law LLP
Fiona	Heskin	Financial Controller	Henry J Lyons
Roger	Hirons	Head of Legal	Sweco UK
Stephen	Holmes	Senior Partner	Fairhurst
Max	Joy	President	Sweco UK
Brian	Kavanagh	Chairperson & Director	Garland
James	Kavanagh	Chief Executive	Varming Consulting Engineers
Michael	Lawson	Partner	Campbell Reith Hill LLP
Dan	Mayers	Associate Architect	BDP
Mark	McCann	Managing Director	Coady Architects
Martin	McCrossan	Director	Blyth & Blyth Consulting Engineers
Michael	Moriarty	Director	T.J. O'Connor & Associates
Tim	Murnane	Managing Director	PUNCH Consulting Engineers
Antony	Oliver	Journalist	Antony Oliver
Alan	O'Rourke	Director	Hulley & Kirkwood
Jane	Paisley	Insurance Manager	Arup
lan	Parker	Group Commercial Director	ACE
Kelvin	Ralfs	Head of Insurance	Arup
John	Ramage	Director	Ramage Young Design Limited
Paul	Reilly	Managing Director, Planning & Advisory	WSP UK
John	Roberts	Director	AFL Architects
Craig	Roberts	Professional Risks Director	Griffiths & Armour
Mark	Sadler	Partner	Campbell Reith Hill LLP
Graeme	Tinney	Chief Executive Officer - Europe	Griffiths & Armour Europe DAC
Kevin	Tosh	Director	Richard Jackson Limited
Chana	\A/alah	Managing Director	MCODM Architecture & Lirban Degian

MCORM Architecture & Urban Design

BDP

Shane

Heather

Walsh

Wells

Managing Director

Group Finance Director



Overview

This publication addresses pressing challenges faced by the construction, insurance and legal sectors. These issues were highlighted and discussed at a series of roundtable events held by Griffiths & Armour and were singled out as being major barriers to our clients' ability to operate and their long-term sustainability. The areas of concern were:

A legal system which has evolved to:

- i. Create an environment in which firms are encouraged to compete on their ability and willingness to assume liability via onerous contracts, rather than given the opportunity to focus on the delivery of quality projects.
- ii. Impose considerable costs on the industry through the creation of bespoke contracts on most projects.
- iii. Continue to impose liability on the construction team on a joint and several liability basis, despite developments internationally in the law which point to a more equitable path.

A construction sector where:

- i. Quality issues continue to create problems.
- ii. Hybrid working models are creating new opportunities and challenges.
- iii. 'Modern Methods of Construction' are being heralded as solutions, particularly in the context of achieving climate change targets, but with apparent doubts around their efficacy and thereby current insurability.

A Professional Indemnity insurance market:

- i. Which for decades has acted as an enabler for liability inflation.
- ii. That continues to drive a silo-based approach and, as constituted today, is almost incapable of facilitating true collaboration.
- iii. Where arguments around coverage and value for money continue to be hotly debated.

Recommendations

Our recommendations for potential change are wide ranging and include short, medium and long-term goals. They include a number of approaches to altering the liability environment for those firms working in construction, whilst seeking to improve the ultimate outcome for those buying design and construction services.

"All too often I have seen the impact of project teams focussing solely on cost rather than ultimate value, and the associated culture of 'blame' this can generate – projects driven in this way ultimately give the construction industry a poor reputation and lead us to a race to the bottom. Good project management is about people and outturn results." **Peter Anderson**



CALLS TO ACTION:

- For the construction, legal and insurance industries to come together in an open, collaborative forum to help drive the 'systems thinking' approach at the core of the Building Safety Act and address the climate change emergency.
- For Government in the UK to adopt and mandate a standard form of contract for use on publicly funded work, recognising the need for a more equitable and fair apportionment of risk.
- Consideration be given to adopting statutory 'fair principles' around contracting, aligned to the requirements and expectations of the new building safety regime.
- For Government in the UK and Ireland to revisit the law on joint and several liability and consider new developments internationally that bridge the gap between a pure joint and several liability model and a pure proportionate liability model.

- Cultural shift in the legal and insurance sector to support dispute avoidance initiatives.
- For the insurance industry to be more pro-active in sharing its concerns on modern methods of construction to head off problems and support the construction industry's drive towards addressing the climate emergency.
- To begin thinking about how we can move from an adversarial model of dispute resolution and what insurance solutions could support a genuinely collaborative future.

In presenting this publication our aim is to try to bring about significant change. This goal echoes the sentiments shared by participants at our events, who universally expressed a desire to shift their focus from the burdens of worrying about contracts, liability, and insurance to a stronger emphasis on delivering for their clients. Our aspiration, intention, and commitment lie in facilitating this shift. While the solutions we propose in response to the key issues identified will not be definitive, our primary objective is to start a dialogue. By bringing together diverse voices and perspectives to re-examine our approaches, especially at a time when the industry stands on the cusp of radical change, we believe this effort will prove to be a valuable investment for all involved.

The key will be what happens next: how are we going to work together to move from dialogue to concerted action?



12 Princes Parade, Princes Dock, Liverpool, L3 1BG

E: info@griffithsandarmour.com

T: 0151 236 5656

griffithsandarmour.com